THE ARCHAEOLOGY OF THE TEMPLE TO JUNO IN CARTHAGE (*AEN.* 1. 446–93)

DISKIN CLAY

I. TRACES ON THE SHORE OF CARTHAGE

There is a legend told of Aristippus. He was shipwrecked on the shore of Rhodes. There in his despair he discovered geometrical figures drawn in the sand, and these gave him good hope, for in them he saw the traces of humankind. *Bene speremus,* was his encouragement to his companions, *hominum enim vestigia video!* The same tale is told of Plato. He too was driven by a storm to an unknown land, and on its shores he discovered geometrical figures. These symbols of humanity, even more than the evident signs of cultivation of this unknown land, gave Plato and his companions courage: they recognized that they had been driven to a land not merely of humans but of true humanity.[1]

Vergil tells a similar and even more symbolic story of Aeneas. When they had almost come within sight of Italy (*Aen.* 1. 34–35), Aeneas and his fleet were driven by a storm to the shores of Libya. These shores seemed deserted to the shipwrecked Aeneas, and the land seemed a land in which he would be destitute and unknown: "'ipse ignotus, egens, Libyae deserta peragro'" (1. 384). But Aeneas soon discovers that this desert is inhabited, and, in the evident traces of its nascent civilization, he discovers its humanity precisely as he discovers himself depicted in a mural in a temple to Juno (1. 488–89).

His first prospect of the civilization of Carthage is from a hill from which he looks down on the new city in the making. From this height he can observe the transformation of a collection of African huts into a city of majestic buildings; and, unawares, he glimpses what he will never live to see—the transformation of Rome from an Arcadian village into the marble and monumental city of Augustus.[2] In the distance he can make

1. Aristippus: Vitr. *De arch.* 6. 1; Plato: Cic. *Rep.* 1. 17. 29. The anecdote, as it is told of Aristippus, provides the title and frontispiece (taken from Gregory's *Euclidis Elementa* [Oxford, 1703]) for C. J. Glacken's study of nature and culture in western thought, *Traces on the Rhodian Shore* (Berkeley–Los Angeles–London, 1967).

2. The adverb in 1. 421 *magalia quondam* can only reflect the narrator's larger historical perspective; so Serv. ad loc., "MAGALIA QUONDAM: ad poetam: nec enim haec novit Aeneas." The glittering image of what Rome was to become is also projected onto Evander's pastoral Pallanteum and the Capitol: see 8. 348 in the context of 337–50, and 8. 99–100 with Suet. *Aug.* 28. 3.

0009-837X/88/8303-0002$01.00

out the streets of the new city, its gates, and—what affects him most—the rising walls of Carthage, the symbol of his own aspirations for a new Troy founded in the West: "'o fortunati, quorum iam moenia surgunt!'" (1. 437). Among the other features of this new foundation Aeneas can see a theater, the lofty and imposing setting for plays to be staged at some future date (1. 429 *scaenis decora alta futuris*).[3] Like every other monument in Carthage, this theater is still under construction; and, as in every other detail of the narrative of Book 1, the future of the *Aeneid* is in the making. We are reminded that Aeneas' first sight of this new land was theatrical. From the shore on which he had landed Aeneas looked up to high cliffs bordered by a shimmering backdrop (*scaena*) of trees (1. 164–65).[4]

We do not know what dramas will be enacted in the theater of Carthage, except perhaps for one—the Vergilian tragedy of Queen Dido, who in her nightmares is driven by Aeneas, as was Orestes by his mother's Furies (4. 471 *Agamemnonius scaenis agitatus Orestes*). If Aeneas discovers signs of the civilization of Carthage in what had at first seemed a desert, he also discovers portents of what awaits him in the future of the *Aeneid.* As he enters the city, Aeneas sees what he could not make out from his distant vantage. Hidden in a grove is a temple to Juno; like Dido's theater, this too is still under construction (1. 446–47 "hic templum Iunoni ingens Sidonia Dido / condebat"). It occupies the spot where the new colonists from the East had excavated the portent of a horse's head (1. 443–44 "signum, quod regia Juno / monstrarat, caput acris equi"). This fierce head is a *signum* and a *monstrum;* it portends those moments in the *Aeneid* when the horse is seen as a symbol of warfare and when the coming conflict between bellicose Italy and bellicose Carthage is glimpsed in a future that lies beyond the *Aeneid.*[5] The theatrical landscape of the shores of Carthage, the rising theater that will be the scene of the tragedy of Dido, and the horse's head that points to wars in Italy and Africa prepare for Vergil's description of the paintings Aeneas studies on the walls of the temple that Dido is dedicating to Juno (1. 466–93). And this description is a portent of the coming warfare, the *Iliad* of the *Aeneid.*

Aeneas is unaware of the significance of the location of the temple to Juno; he is unaware of the portent of the horse's head. But this portent stands as a distant background to the scenes of warfare that fascinate him within the temple (1. 456 *miratur,* 494 *miranda*).[6] In the painted

3. Retaining the *alta* of the manuscripts, despite the repetition from 1. 427–28 (*alta theatris / fundamenta*); cf. 2. 448.

4. This striking metaphor, now quite domesticated in English, is restored to life by G. Williams, *Tradition and Originality in Roman Poetry* (Oxford, 1971), p. 642. Although she does not treat this scene, F. Muecke's delicate "Foreshadowing and Dramatic Irony in the Story of Dido," *AJP* 104 (1983): 134–55, provides a stage for my interpretation of this proleptic line.

5. For the horse as a portent of warfare, see J. Bayet, "L'omen du cheval à Carthage," *REL* 19 (1941): 185, n. 5, and V. Buchheit, "Aeneas vor Karthago," *Gymnasium* 71 (1964): 429–30. The promise of warfare in Italy is glimpsed in the appearance of four horses in *Aen.* 3. 537–43 (the *omen* of 537).

6. Cf. Aeneas' absorption at 6. 651, 854, and, most strikingly, 8. 730–31.

panels that decorate the temple, he sees a past he is familiar with and a past in which he recognizes himself. And the recognition of this past in Carthage gives him some reason for confidence in his adversity (1. 450–52):

> hoc primum in luco nova res oblata timorem
> leniit, hic primum Aeneas sperare salutem
> ausus et adflictis melius confidere rebus.

One can ask "What is Aeneas so happy about?"[7] Aeneas is never a happy man; but at this moment, when he has entered the temple to Juno, he discovers in this monument of human art and devotion scenes from the Trojan War (1. 453–56 "namque . . . / . . . videt Iliacas ex ordine pugnas"). The scenes that engage Aeneas will soon engage us. They are displayed in eight panels and they constitute what I would describe as the first Vergilian *Iliad* within the *Aeneid* (1. 466–93).

When Aeneas told his mother, Venus, that he was unknown in the desert of Libya (1. 384) he was unaware of the civilization he would discover there and of Dido's knowledge of him and the Trojan War. But Vergil's reader has already recognized that he is entering familiar terrain. He has recognized traces of the *Odyssey* on Vergil's Carthaginian shore. The storm-scene with which the narrative proper opens goes back to *Odyssey* 5. 282–312, and Vergil has firmly established Aeneas as an Odysseus at the beginning of the *Odyssey* of his *Aeneid*.[8] Juno figures as the angry Poseidon of *Odyssey* 5. And Aeneas' port of entry to Carthage—with its cave of the nymphs (1. 166–68), the island protecting the bay where he finds refuge, and the twin peaks that define the African coast as a theatrical backdrop—belongs neither to old nor to new Carthage.[9] The scene belongs rather to the *Odyssey,* as does much else in this book, and it combines in its ambiguous orientation to the reader features of the coastline of the Cyclops' land (*Od.* 9. 116, 136–41), with its "Goat Island" (*Od.* 9. 117–35), the harbor to the land of the Laestrygonians (*Od.* 10. 87–94), and the landing of Odysseus on both Scheria[10]

7. As does W. R. Johnson, *Darkness Visible: A Study of Vergil's "Aeneid"* (Berkeley–Los Angeles–London, 1976), p. 103; my own answer will be that Aeneas is cheered because he has discovered the traces of humanity—Vergilian humanity—on the Carthaginian shore; cf. P. J. Enk's congenial formulation in "Vergiliana," *Mnemosyne* 41 (1913): 385: "Templi tabulae Aeneae ostendere possunt hic non homines barbaros colere, sed viros qui nihil humani a se alienum putent."

8. He does this, of course, by his choice of the word *virum* in *Aen.* 1. 1 and the repetition of *multum* in 1. 3 and 5; 1. 92–94 is a deliberate evocation of *Od.* 5. 299–312; and 1. 198–207 evokes *Od.* 10. 174–77. For the general relation of the *Aeneid* to the *Odyssey,* see G. N. Knauer, *Die "Aeneis" und Homer: Studien zur poetischen Technik Vergils mit Listen der Homerzitate in der "Aeneis,"* Hypomnemata 7 (Göttingen, 1964), pp. 152–73.

9. Servius (ad 1. 159) recognized that we do not have here the description of an actual place in Africa; he notes that some readers referred to New Carthage in Spain, for which see Polyb. 10. 10. 2, cited by R. G. Austin, *P. Vergilii Maronis "Aeneidos" Liber Primus* (Oxford, 1971), p. 72. On the complex literary ancestry of this allusive and ambiguous scene, see Williams, *Tradition and Originality,* p. 643. For the significance of "Goat Island," which lies off the shore of the Cyclops' land, see J. S. Clay, "Goat Island: *Od.* 9. 116–141," *CQ* 30 (1980): 261–64.

10. Macrobius saw that Dido recalls Nausicaa, *Sat.* 5. 2. 13; he could have cited *Aen.* 1. 498–505 and *Od.* 6. 102–9, as had Probus (ap. Gell. *NA* 9. 9. 12–17).

and Ithaca (*Od.* 13. 96–104).[11] Aeneas is quite unaware of this literary and spiritual geography, but Vergil's reader is reminded of it and left in suspense. Either Carthage is a kind of homecoming and safe harbor for Aeneas in his wanderings, or it is a place of still greater dangers.

Aeneas himself mirrors the indecision of Vergil's reader. Like Odysseus (cf. *Od.* 6. 119–21, 9. 173–76), Aeneas is caught between the possibilities of Phaeacian civilization and savagery. As he explores this new land that bears no marks of cultivation, he wonders if it is inhabited by men or beasts (1. 308 *hominesne, feraene*). And even when he has discovered the signs of human civilization (1. 418–38), Aeneas, like Odysseus in the land of the Phaeacians, must approach Carthage wrapped in a cloud (1. 439). The traces of humankind are not necessarily those of humanity. Vergil has poised his reader between expectations of Phaeacian civilization and Cyclopean savagery as he brings Aeneas into the city of Carthage itself, to view there the Carthaginian version of the Trojan War that gives him hope even in his grief over its pathetic history (cf. 1. 459–65, 485). The literary archaeology of the temple to Juno in Carthage is something that would give Aeneas courage. For Vergil had meditated on the text of the *Odyssey* in composing his *Odyssey* of the *Aeneid,* and he discovered in the *Odyssey* his inspiration for the paintings displayed in the temple to Juno, paintings that Dido seems to have commissioned herself.[12] He discovered the inspiration for this, the first ecphrasis of the *Aeneid,* in a characteristically Greek boast and in a telling moment of barbarian silence.

Protinus aërias Phaeacum abscondimus arces (3. 291); *proxima Circaeae raduntur litora terrae* (7. 10). Vergil has led his reader by indirection to the source of his inspiration. The course of the *Aeneid* in Books 1–6 follows, grazes, and veers away from the coast of the *Odyssey,* much as the *Odyssey* itself grazes but steers clear of the *Iliad.*[13] Vergil has created Carthage in the distant image of the Scheria of the *Odyssey.* As Aeneas and Achates enter Carthage, they discover a recognition of the history of Troy and its sufferings (*labores*). And as did Odysseus when he heard Demodocus' Odyssean version of the events of the Trojan War (*Od.* 8. 73–82), Aeneas weeps as he recognizes himself and his city's past in the paintings in the temple to Juno in Carthage (1. 465; cf. 485 and *Od.* 8. 83–96). But this scene in Vergil's Carthage has still another background, which emerges from the darkness of the Cyclops' cave in the *Odyssey.*

The harbor of the Cyclops' land, with its "Goat Island," so similar to the inlet where Aeneas found safe harbor in Carthage, is liminal to an awareness of the savage possibilities not only of Carthage but also of Italy and of the *Aeneid* itself. As he stands before the paintings of the

11. Macrob. *Sat.* 5. 3. 18 "Videte . . . portum ad civitatem Didonis ex Ithaca migrantem."

12. As is implied, I think, by 1. 446–47 and by 597 (which also recognizes Dido's offer to join Trojan and Tyrian). It is indicated too by her very eagerness for the work under way (505 *instans operi*) and by her inexhaustible curiosity concerning the Trojan war and the fall of Troy (748–56).

13. So G. Nagy, *The Best of the Achaeans: Concepts of the Hero in Archaic Greek Poetry* (Baltimore and London, 1979), p. 21.

tale of Troy in the temple to Juno, Aeneas can ask his companion (1. 459–60): "'quis iam locus, . . . , Achate, / quae regio in terris nostri non plena laboris?'" Achates does not answer, but Vergil does. An awareness and appreciation of the history of Troy pervade the *Aeneid.* But Vergil knew that the civilization of the Phaeacians had its antipodes in the land of the Cyclops. When the Cyclops first encounters Odysseus and his men, he asks them the civilized and formulaic question (*Od.* 9. 252–55): "'Strangers, who are you? Where did you begin your voyage over the paths of the sea? Do you have some business in mind, or do you sail over the sea like pirates, who are wanderers and who risk their lives with the cast of the dice, as they bring their cargo of grief to strangers?'" In response, Odysseus claims with confidence that he will be recognized as an Achaean, come from Troy, and that he and his men can boast that they are a part of the army of Agamemnon, "'whose epic fame is greatest under the vault of heaven, at least for now'" (9. 264 τοῦ δὴ νῦν γε μέγιστον ὑπουράνιον κλέος ἐστί). In the face of this claim, with its clear implication that the *Iliad* has spread throughout the world, the Cyclops is silent. And he is silent too about Odysseus' wanderings and the epic poetry of the *Odyssey* (cf. 9. 259–62). His ignorance of Homeric poetry is total.

But the reverse is true of the Phaeacians.[14] And in Vergil's Carthage there is a version of the question the Cyclops puts to Odysseus and his men. At first it seems Phaeacian. In Scheria, Alcinous asks Odysseus to identify himself (*Od.* 8. 550), and at length Odysseus replies that he is Odysseus, son of Laertes, whose fame has reached far heaven (*Od.* 9. 19–20). This seems to be the proximate model for the question that Venus, disguised as a nymph, asked Aeneas and Achates (1. 369): *sed vos qui tandem?* But her second question more closely reproduces the curiosity of the Cyclops: *quibis aut venistis ab oris?* Aeneas answers both (1. 375–76, 378–79): "nos Troia antiqua, si vestras forte per auris / Troiae nomen iit . . ."; "sum pius Aeneas . . . *fama super aethera notus.*" The second part of his answer not only recognizes his mother's question (and its model in Alcinous' question) but also conveys Vergil's response to the force of a particle (νῦν γε) in Odysseus' response to the Cyclops (*Od.* 9. 264). Vergil, in his own invention of Roman history, is asserting his own claim to superiority over the Homeric epic. Agamemnon's fame is confined to heaven; Aeneas' reaches beyond it.

By contrast to the savage silence of the Cyclops, Dido makes it clear that her land and her values are not Cyclopean, even if she (like the Phaeacians) is driven to extraordinary caution (cf. 1. 562–64). To Ilioneus' speech identifying his party as Trojans, Dido replies (1. 565–68):

> "quis genus Aeneadum, quis Troiae nesciat urbem,
> virtutesque virosque aut tanti incendia belli?

14. Alcinous has an expert's appreciation of Odysseus' mastery, as a singer, of the tradition of the *Iliad* and the νόστοι (11. 363–70). For Demodocus' song of the quarrel between Odysseus and Achilles, see J. S. Clay, *The Wrath of Athena: Gods and Men in the "Odyssey"* (Princeton, 1983), pp. 96–112.

non obtunsa adeo gestamus pectora Poeni,
nec tam adversus equos Tyria Sol iungit ab urbe."

Aeneas was right in what he said to Achates: the traces of a knowledge of the story of Troy on the Carthaginian shore will bring some safety (1. 463): "solve metus; feret haec aliquam tibi fama salutem." This precisely is Dido's response to Ilioneus (1. 562): "solvite corde metum, Teucri, secludite curas." And when Aeneas has made his presence known and named himself to the queen (1. 595–96 "coram quem quaeritis, adsum, / Troius Aeneas"), Dido responds (1. 617): *tune ille Aeneas . . .*? Her recognition of Aeneas is so charged with admiration that Dante imitated her language in the *Inferno* to convey his own shock at the recognition of Vergil on the slopes of Hell (1. 79): *Or se' tu quel Virgilio . . .*? Dido goes on to offer an account of just how she came to learn of Aeneas and his ancestry. Her knowledge cannot be epic, so it comes perforce from Teucer as he found refuge in Sidon (1. 619–26).

But, from a motivation that belongs to the narrative and not to the individual, Dido also knows, without being told, that Aeneas has been wandering at sea for seven years (1. 755–56).[15] That is, even as a character within the *Aeneid,* Dido is also aware of the *Aeneid* itself. In this awareness both she and Aeneas lose some of their objectivity and merge with the larger character of the author of the *Aeneid.*[16] In the civilized poetry of the *Aeneid,* there is no place that is unaware of the poetry of the *Aeneid.*[17] Aeneas, in his subjective reading of the painted panels in the temple to Juno, prepares, quite unwittingly, for the *Iliad* of the *Aeneid* and the warfare of Books 7–12; and he recognizes in Dido a like—and Vergilian—sensibility when he responds to Dido's generous offer to join Troy and Carthage—and to her authorship of the paintings he has just studied—by saying (1. 592): "o sola infandos Troiae miserata labores." *Labor* is his own characterization of the history of Troy (1. 459–60). It is also Vergil's.

II. THE FIRST "ILIAD" OF THE "AENEID"

In this, the first ecphrasis of the *Aeneid,* Vergil has confused the pictorial and the narrative, and in so doing he has subordinated the art of Dido's Punic painters to the art of the *Aeneid.*[18] He has done so for a

15. H. Jacobson notes that in Euripides' *Helen* (112, 775–76) the events are said to take place seven years after the Trojan War ("Vergil's Dido and Euripides' *Helen,*" *AJP* 108 [1987]: 167–68).

16. So Brooks Otis can describe Dido as Aeneas' "alter ego," *Virgil: A Study in Civilized Poetry* (Oxford, 1964), p. 67, and describe Vergil's "subjective" style in terms that apply to the episode at the temple to Juno (p. 51): " . . . we are never sure when he is simply describing the character's feelings or putting his own feelings into the character—he actually seems to do both things."

17. In Latium, Ilioneus (7. 222–27) can assume that everyone knows of the tale of Troy and, implicitly, Aeneas' part in the story Homer did not tell. Latinus reveals his knowledge of the Trojans even before Ilioneus has spoken (7. 195–96, 206–11), as does Evander (8. 152–71); and Pallas is stunned by the sound of so great a name (8. 121). In Africa, Dido nearly recites the opening of the *Aeneid* in her response to Aeneas' *Odyssey* (4. 13–14): *heu, quibus ille / iactatus fatis.*

18. To put the distinction between the two media epigrammatically, with Lessing, "succession of time is the province of the poet just as space is that of the painter" (*Laocoön: An Essay on the Limits of Painting and Poetry,* trans. E. A. McCormick [Baltimore and London, 1984], p. 91). In Vergil's

reason. He has made Aeneas both the reader and the narrator of the Trojan War as it was represented in the murals of Dido's new temple to Juno.[19] And in Aeneas' seemingly personal and subjective reading of the events—*quorum pars magna fui* (2. 6)—he has inscribed the lines of the *Iliad* of his own *Aeneid.*[20] Vergil's technique in describing these paintings is distinct from his technique of ecphrasis elsewhere in the poem. Only here in the *Aeneid*—and, it would seem, in the tradition of ecphrasis—does the viewer confront himself depicted in the work he views; and only here is Aeneas, and not the poet, the narrator who describes the work of art. There is still another difference. The description of the shield of Aeneas in Book 8 refracts the events of Roman history that lie beyond the *Aeneid* itself; but the description of the Trojan War painted on the walls of the temple to Juno in Carthage projects its image onto Books 6–12 of the *Aeneid* itself.

The golden cloak awarded to Cloanthus (5. 250–57), the golden panels Daedalus enchased on the doors of his temple to Apollo at Cumae (6. 14–41), the shield of Turnus (7. 783–93), the heavy gold belt of Pallas (10. 497–99): these are all described by the narrator of the *Aeneid,* often with emotional engagement in the scenes he is describing.[21] But as he stands within the temple to Juno, Aeneas himself describes some part of what he sees to his companion, *fidus Achates,* who is present as the audience to Aeneas' reading of the pathetic scenes depicted on the walls of the temple (1. 456–63):

---

ecphrasis, we begin with spatial markers: *en Priamus* (461), *hac . . . hac* (467, 468, adverbs usually used with verbs of motion), *parte alia* (474). These are qualified and finally replaced by the strictly temporal habits of the narrative and the adverb *interea* (479); significantly, Aeneas is pulled into the temporal, not painterly, narrative by his sympathetic response (483): "ingentem gemitum dat pectore ab imo." All sense of space and action frozen in the painter's art is lost in panels VII and VIII, as the Vergilian narrative gains ascendancy over the pictorial.

19. When I speak of Aeneas as the "reader" of the panels depicted on the temple to Juno I have in mind the description Richard Brilliant proposes for the viewer as one of the narrators of the stories told in Roman and Etruscan art, in *Visual Narratives: Story-Telling in Etruscan and Roman Art* (Ithaca and London, 1984), pp. 15–20 and passim. In one sense, Aeneas is the narrator of the visual narrative of the Troy story; in another, the painters in Carthage are responsible for the narrative; but ultimately Vergil is its author. That the mute objects of art described in the *Aeneid* need to be "read" is suggested by the action of Troilus' reversed spear as it scores—or inscribes—the plain of Troy (478): *et versa pulvis inscribitur hasta.* Aeneas and Achates "read" the golden panels on the door to the entrance of the Sibyl's cave (6. 33–34): *quin protinus omnia / perlegerent oculis* (a reading that is incomplete). The phrase Vergil chose to describe the transformation of Io on Turnus' shield (7. 791) is *argumentum ingens;* Varro *Sat. Men.* 398 provides the appropriate commentary : "poesis est perpetuum argumentum e rhythmis, ut *Ilias* Homeri."

20. My phrase, the *Iliad* of the *Aeneid,* derives from Otis, *Virgil,* pp. 313–82. When I speak of the "first *Iliad*" of the *Aeneid,* I modify the terms of W. S. Anderson's revealing essay, "Virgil's Second *Iliad,*" *TAPA* 88 (1957): 17–30.

21. Cf. *Aen.* 6. 21 (*miserum!*), 6. 30–31 (the poet's address to Icarus), and 10. 497 (*impressum . . . nefas*). For a fine appreciation of the empathy of the poet-narrator with the emotions of the artist and failed narrator of *Aen.* 6. 14–41, see M. C. J. Putnam, "Daedalus, Virgil, and the End of Art," *AJP* 108 (1987): 173–89. The emotional engagement in reading the art depicted in the *Aeneid* has been prepared for by the engagement of Aeneas—and the narrator describing Aeneas' narration—before the paintings of the temple to Juno in Carthage. In Vergil, the introduction of the author into his epic narrative replicates the technique of the author as he draws his reader into the narrative—a technique writ small in the first ecphrasis of the *Aeneid;* for a characterization of this technique as set against the techniques of Homer and Apollonius of Rhodes, see B. Effe, "Epische Objektivität und auktoriales Erzählen: Zur Entfaltung emotionaler Subjektivität in Vergils *Aeneis,*" *Gymnasium* 90 (1983): 171–86, esp. 183.

> videt Iliacas ex ordine pugnas
> bellaque iam fama totum vulgata per orbem,
> Atridas Priamumque et saevum ambobus Achillem.
> constitit et lacrimans "quis iam locus" inquit "Achate,
> quae regio in terris nostri non plena laboris?
> en Priamus. sunt hic etiam sua praemia laudi;
> sunt lacrimae rerum et mentem mortalia tangunt.
> solve metus; feret haec aliquam tibi fama salutem."

Aeneas is, in effect, the narrator of the first *Iliad* of the *Aeneid,* and he involves his companion in his narration and sensibility just as Vergil involves his reader in the *Aeneid.* As narrator Vergil is guided by the gaze of his character (cf. 1. 466, 470, 487, and 488); but he is also careful to reveal Aeneas' reading of the paintings as subjective. Thus Vergil leads his audience to expect a very different reading of the panels, for he has described the battles at Troy as being depicted *ex ordine* (1. 456), in their chronological sequence. Aeneas himself was prepared to give his history in just such a sequence as he encountered his mother in Carthage (1. 372–73); the past of which Aeneas is a part stretches far back into history, both human and divine, and it joins Troy to the Arcadians of Pallanteum (cf. 8. 134–42). Aeneas conceives of it in the orderly fashion of Roman historiography or the Ennian epic, as *annales:* "'O dea, si prima repetens ab origine pergam / et vacet annalis nostrorum audire laborum. . . .'" But Vergil's phrase *ex ordine* is wrong for Aeneas' history of the Trojan War. Unlike the history implied in the series of funerary masks displayed *ex ordine* in the palace of Latinus (7. 155) or (with a variation) the series of wars worked into Aeneas' shield (8. 629 *pugnata ex ordine bella*), Aeneas' history is not historical. As Aeneas scans the scenes of warfare depicted in the temple to Juno, he picks out one figure among them all. His first impression of the gallery is of the entire history of the war. He sees Priam, frozen in the moment chosen by the painter, caught between the sons of Atreus and Achilles—*saevum ambobus Achillem* (1. 458).

The eight panels that engage Aeneas as a reader and as a narrator are not described in any chronological order. Their order is psychological, psychagogic, and protreptic. They point to the warfare of the *Aeneid,* and their very subjectivity is the higher objectivity of the *Aeneid.* (Or perhaps it would be fairer to say that their subjective style is the subjective style of Vergil himself.) The panels are presented in this order:

I–II	(466–68)	The tides of war
III	(469–73)	The death of Rhesus
IV	(474–78)	The death of Troilus
V	(479–82)	The supplication of Athena
VI	(483–87)	The ransom of Hector's body
VII	(488–89)	Aeneas and Memnon in battle
VIII	(490–93)	Penthesilea

These battles are not read in any historical sequence; nor are the paintings all scenes of battle. Rhesus is cut down in his sleep (panel III);

Troilus, unarmed, is dragged along the plains of Troy by his chariot (IV)—as was Hector (cf. 1. 483 and the detail of *Il.* 22. 401–3); the women of Troy approach the temple of Pallas, who averts her eyes from the spectacle of their suppliant grief (V); and Achilles is ransoming the body of Hector, which he has already dragged three times around the walls of Troy (VI). It is a plausible reading to view these eight panels as articulating groups of four paired scenes.[22] But still another stance reveals two panels of warfare (I–II and VII–VIII) framing four inner panels that depict Greek savagery and divine hostility—the perfect offering to Juno.

Greek cruelty and the fate of Troy are not the only themes that connect the four inner panels (III–VI). What Aeneas sees and looks for are scenes of hope frustrated, fate affirmed, youth cut off, the weaker falling before the stronger, a god adverse, and the body of a son stretched out dead (and naked) before his father's eyes. Aeneas groans at the sight of Hector's body and Priam's vulnerable supplication of Achilles (VI). This groan and his earlier tears (in 1. 459 and 465) are a Trojan—and a Vergilian—response to this first *Iliad* of the *Aeneid.*

Sunt hic etiam sua praemia laudi (1. 461). The rewards that are fitting to Trojan merit are Vergilian, and they go not to those renowned in warfare (the Greeks of 6. 478, *bello clari*) but to those who have fallen in warfare (the Trojans of 6. 481, *bello caduci*). *Laus,* merit and its reward in fame, is not the merit of empire, conquest, and triumph. Its reward in Carthage is a monument of pathetic art, an art and sensibility depicting suffering, hope cut off, and ultimate failure. It is the art of Dido's artisans, and it is appropriately called *labor* (1. 455). It is an art to which Dido responds (1. 597 "'o sola infandos Troiae miserata labores'"), as could Apollo (cf. 6. 56 "'Phoebe, gravis Troiae semper miserate labores'"). It is the art of Aeneas' subjective reading of the pictures in the temple to Juno, and ultimately it is the art of the *Aeneid.*

Some readers of the *Aeneid* have been aware of the distant image these paintings of the Trojan War project onto the *Iliad* of the *Aeneid.*[23] The women of Latinus' city reenact the fate of the suppliant women of Troy (11. 477–85 and panel V), and the divine silence that follows their prayer to Pallas Athena must be filled by a line from Book 1 to become articulate: "diva solo fixos oculos adversa tenebat" (1. 482). The tides of war on the Troad (I–II) wash over the plains of Latium as Turnus' Hector breaks into the stockade of Aeneas' Achaeans (9. 756–818) and as Aeneas turns the last battle of the war against the city of Latinus itself (12. 554–613). The warriors on both sides of this war in Italy are young—as is the *Troiana iuventus* of panel I (1. 467).[24] And Penthesilea

22. So R. D. Williams, "The Pictures on Dido's Temple (*Aeneid* 1. 450–93)," *CQ* 10 (1960): 145–51.

23. K. Stanley was one of these, "Irony and Foreshadowing in *Aeneid* I, 462," *AJP* 86 (1965): 274, as was Johnson, *Darkness Visible,* p. 103. This irony is anticipated by a small detail at the beginning of the book, the "altars" (109–10) that threaten Aeneas' ships as they are driven from Italy by Juno's storm (a suggestion I owe to Sara Clay).

24. *Iuventus* is more than a metrically convenient counter for "company" (*pace* Austin, *"Aeneidos" Liber Primus,* p. 158). What is pathetic about warfare in the *Aeneid,* and what distinguishes the *Aeneid*

(VIII) is clearly recognizable in the figure of Camilla,[25] as is Troilus (IV), *impar congressus Achilli* (1. 475), in the figures of Pallas and Lausus.[26]

But there is still another sign of Vergil's proleptic art in his description of the pictures in the temple of Juno: the figure of Achilles. As he stands transfixed before the pictures in Dido's gallery, Aeneas recognizes him first, with the Atreids and Priam—*saevum ambobus Achillem* (1. 458). In the second panel he sees him again, ominously poised in his chariot as the Trojans are routed (1. 468 *instaret curru cristatus Achilles*). He is seen for the third time in the sixth panel, as he ransoms Hector's body (1. 484 *auro corpus vendebat Achilles*). And it comes as no surprise that he is present and ominous, but invisible and unnamed, in the panel showing Penthesilea in the fury of battle (VIII). Penthesilea will soon fall to his sword; but as Philostratus says when describing what is implied but unrepresented in another painting of Achilles, "this is not in the picture."[27] Finally, and curiously, Achilles is present in the outer and framing panel of warfare (VII), for Memnon will fall to him too, and Aeneas can be seen engaged in battle with the mightiest of the Achaeans only because Achilles is dead.[28]

Achilles, the last and haunting figure in the panels of the temple to Juno in Carthage, is present at the end of the *Aeneid,* as Aeneas becomes the Achilles to a Turnus who reminds us of both Troilus and Hector. Troilus was the unlucky boy who was not equal to combat with Achilles (again, 1. 475 "infelix puer atque impar congressus Achilli"). Throughout the final book of the *Aeneid,* Turnus' age is stressed, as is the inequality of his contest with Aeneas. Latinus becomes a father to

---

from the *Iliad,* is the law by which the young must die *ante ora parentum;* cf. 2. 526–58, esp. 535–39 (on the death of Polites), and 10. 791–856 (the death of Lausus). As Aeneas views Pallas' body, he groans deeply (11. 37 *ingentem gemitum*)—the groan already heard as Aeneas caught sight of the body of Hector laid out before his father (1. 485 "tum vero ingentem gemitum dat pectore ab imo"); the death of Euryalus is indignantly lamented by his mother, 9. 481–97, and, again, we hear in 9. 498–99 Aeneas' first groan in Carthage (*maestusque per omnis / it gemitus*). Perhaps the fittest commentary to these scenes is the Roman prayer that children survive their parents, evoked by Cic. *Nat. D.* 2. 28. 72; cf. the words of Evander, *Aen.* 11. 160–61.

25. V. Pöschl convincingly connects the scene of Penthesilea in battle (panel VIII) with the equally doomed Dido (*Die Dichtkunst Virgils: Bild und Symbol in der "Aeneis"* [Vienna, 1964], p. 120, n. 1; cf. 255 and 279), but he does not look further, to Camilla, as did Stanley, "Irony," pp. 275–76. Cf. 1. 492 and 11. 648–49 and the simile that explicitly draws the two figures together in 11. 659–63. Dante seems to have appreciated the association, for he pairs Penthesilea and Camilla in Limbo (*Inferno* 4. 124 *vidi Camilla e la Pantasilea*).

26. So Pallas is addressed as *miserande puer* (11. 42), and we are reminded of his youth (10. 464) and of his strength that was no equal to Turnus' (10. 458–59 *ausum / viribus imparibus*). We are also reminded of Lausus' youth as Aeneas drives his sword through his body, and of his nameless mother (10. 816–20). It is precisely at the moment when Aeneas feels pity for the boy that he himself is described as a son, *Anchisiades* (10. 822); and he addresses Lausus as *miserande puer* (825) and brings to mind the epithet for Troilus as he calls the boy *infelix* (829). The final detail of this scene is the blood that stains Lausus' hair (832)—a narrative gesture that connects Lausus with Troilus (1. 477) and, indirectly, with Hector (cf. *Il.* 22. 401–3).

27. Philostr. *Imag.* 1. 1–18, the passage Brilliant chose to close his *Visual Narratives,* p. 165.

28. The fate of Memnon is described in Proclus' summary of Arctinus' *Aethiopis* and in the *Tabula Iliaca* (*EGF* p. 33 Kinkel and *Homeri Opera* 5:106. 1–7, 126 Allen); it is illustrated by the Berlin painter on a volute-krater (J. D. Beazley, *Attic Red-Figure Vases*^{2}, vol. 1 [Oxford, 1963], p. 206, no. 132). Aeneas can engage in battle and emerge *principibus permixtum . . . Achivis* only once Achilles has been killed; cf. *Il.* 20. 337–38.

this young warrior, Amata, a mother.[29] And Juno recognizes his impending fate (12. 149): "'hunc *iuvenem imparibus* video concurrere *fatis.*'" She shares the premonitions of Turnus' Rutulians, who see the coming duel between Aeneas and Turnus as an unequal contest and know that Turnus' lot cannot match that of Aeneas (12. 216–18 "At vero Rutulis *impar* ea pugna videri / iamdudum . . . , / tum magis ut propius cernunt *non viribus aequos,*" a disputed line whose sense is clear; 243 *Turni sortem miserantur iniquam*). As was Troilus to Achilles, and Pallas to Turnus, so is Turnus to Aeneas. Turnus too has come to resemble Troilus in his youth, his fate, and his unequal strength. He finally falls as a victim to Aeneas-become-Achilles because he is wearing the golden sword-belt he had stripped from Pallas, with its unspeakable crime enchased upon it (12. 940–44; cf. 10. 497–99). Now Turnus is *infelix* (12. 941). Had Aeneas read the scene on Pallas' familiar belt, he would have seen the young sons of Aegyptus cut down in their bloodied wedding chambers on the first night of their marriage (10. 497 *una sub nocte iugali*).

The phrase and the situation are reminiscent of the panel in the temple to Juno (III) that showed Rhesus slaughtered by Diomedes, asleep in the snow-white tent he had just pitched on the plain of Troy, before his horses could even graze there or drink from the Xanthus. *Nescia mens hominum fati sortisque futurae!* (10. 501). The glimpse Turnus had of heaven opening in its clarity before him (9. 20–22) was deceptive. Rhesus was slaughtered in the peace of his first night on the Troad; Troilus was surprised by Achilles; Pallas knew neither ultimate glory in battle nor marriage; Turnus knew glory in battle, as had Hector, but also ultimate defeat; and he never knew marriage. Achilles, who was ominously present in the temple to Juno in Carthage, is, in the *Iliad* of the *Aeneid,* transformed first into Turnus, and then, finally, into Aeneas (6. 89–90): "alius Latio iam partus Achilles, / natus et ipse dea."[30]

The Johns Hopkins University

29. 12. 50 and 74, noted by Anderson, "Virgil's Second *Iliad,*" p. 29 and n. 17; as Anderson argues (pp. 24–30), Aeneas begins to take on the character of Achilles.

30. Which brings me to the end of the *Aeneid* and Putnam's comment, "Daedalus," p. 196: "Its ending is equivalent to Achilles' killing of Hector. . . . No Iliadic mourning breaks the spell of Aeneas' inexorable blood-lust."

I would like to thank Michael Putnam for his encouragement in writing this essay, John Pollini for his careful reading of an early draft, and the Editor and anonymous referees of *CP.*